



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 59

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Third Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Thursday, December 2, 1999

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Presenting Petitions

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, presented a petition from 648 Albertans requesting the freezing of tuition and institutional fees and an increase in post-secondary education support.

Ms Barrett, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands, presented a petition from 66 Albertans requesting the introduction of legislation banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 307 Albertans requesting the freezing of tuition and institutional fees and an increase in post-secondary education support.

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, presented a petition from 200 Albertans requesting an independent public inquiry of the Workers' Compensation Act including an examination of the operations of the WCB (Workers' Compensation Board), the Appeals Commission, and the criteria for appointments to the Board.

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, presented a petition from 142 Calgary residents requesting increased support for public and separate schools to levels which will cover increased costs.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned, urge the Legislative Assembly to freeze tuition and institutional fees and increase support in the foundation of post-secondary education.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned, urge the Legislative Assembly to freeze tuition and institutional fees and increase support in the foundation of post-secondary education.

On request by Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to conduct an independent public inquiry of the Workers' Compensation Act, including an examination of the operations of the WCB, the Appeals Commission, and the criteria for appointments to the Board.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government to increase support for children in public and separate schools to a level that covers increased costs due to contract settlements, curriculum changes, technology, and aging schools.

On request by Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned, urge the Legislative Assembly to freeze tuition and institutional fees and increase support in the foundation of post-secondary education.

On request by Ms Paul, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Castle Downs, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to conduct an independent public inquiry of the Workers' Compensation Act, including an examination of the operations of the WCB, the Appeals Commission, and the criteria for appointments to the Board.

On request by Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government to increase support for children in public and separate schools to a level that covers increased costs due to contract settlements, curriculum changes, technology, and aging schools.

On request by Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government to increase support for children in public and separate schools to a level that covers increased costs due to contract settlements, curriculum changes, technology, and aging schools.

Notices of Motions

Ms Barrett, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands, gave oral notice of her intention to move the following motion under Standing Order 40:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to facilitate a fair settlement in the labour dispute at the Bethany Care Centre in Cochrane where the use of unqualified replacement staff is threatening patient safety.

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer:

News release dated December 2, 1999, entitled "ATB Reports Strong Second Quarter Results," prepared by Alberta Treasury Branches
Sessional Paper 1206/99

News release dated December 2, 1999, entitled "Finance Ministers Release the Details of Their Plan to Improve Competitiveness and Canadians' Standard of Living," with attached report dated December 1999, entitled "Improving the Competitiveness and Standard of Living of Canadians: Common Position of Provincial and Territorial Finance Ministers"

Sessional Paper 1207/99

Hon. Mr. Paszkowski, Minister of Municipal Affairs, pursuant to the Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act, cF-18.5, s81:

Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy, Annual Report 1998-99
Sessional Paper 1208/99

Hon. Mr. Paszkowski, Minister of Municipal Affairs:

Alberta Elevating Devices and Amusement Rides Safety Association, Annual Report April 1, 1998 to March 31, 1999

Sessional Paper 1209/99

Hon. Mr. Paszkowski, Minister of Municipal Affairs:

Response to Written Question No. WQ172 asked for by Mr. Sapers on April 14, 1999:

How many times has the working group established by Alberta Transportation and Utilities Disaster Services to analyze potential emergency consequences resulting from Y2K (Year 2000) computer problems met, who makes up this group, and what recommendations and action plans has the group produced?

Sessional Paper 1210/99

Mr. Lougheed, Hon. Member for Clover Bar-Fort Saskatchewan:

Premier's Council on the Status of Persons with Disabilities, Annual Report 1998-99

Sessional Paper 1211/99

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness:

News release dated November 4, 1999, entitled "MacBeth Calls for Moratorium on Expansion of Private Health Care," prepared by the Alberta Liberal Caucus

Sessional Paper 1212/99

Letter dated November 30, 1999, from Dan Miller, Premier, Government of British Columbia, to Right Honourable Jean Chrétien, Prime Minister of Canada, expressing concerns over comments made by the Honourable Allan Rock in various media on November 18, 1999, regarding the current reality of medicare in all provinces and requesting a national debate on the issue

Sessional Paper 1213/99

Hon. Mr. Dunford, Minister of Human Resources and Employment:

Response to Written Question No. WQ245 asked for by Mrs. Soetaert:

How many staff (full time equivalents) were employed by the former Department of Labour to investigate all industrial accidents, including those in mining and off-highway logging, between April 1, 1992 and March 31, 1993 and between April 1, 1998 and March 31, 1999?

Sessional Paper 1214/99

Response to Written Question No. WQ252 asked for by Mrs. Soetaert:

How many accidents involving log-haul trucks on off-highway roads were investigated each year from April 1, 1992 to March 31, 1999, in how many cases was the weight load checked, in how many cases was the weight load in excess of the rated vehicle capacity (as prescribed in the Canada Motor Vehicle Safety Regulations) and of those cases, in how many was the weight load in excess of the Alberta permitted winter weight?

Sessional Paper 1215/99

Return to Order of the Assembly No. MR251 asked for by Mrs. Soetaert:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:

Copies of any memos, documents or other reports comparing the accident rate of log haul trucks in Alberta and those in other Canadian jurisdictions or the Northwestern United States, that have been conducted since January 1, 1996.

Sessional Paper 1216/99

Ms Barrett, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands:

Memorandum dated November 20, 1999, from Cathy Brett, Senior Director, Bethany Care Society, to all Bethany Care Society Staff regarding non-Bethany staff working at the Bethany Care Centre Cochrane during the Guild strike

Sessional Paper 1217/99

Letter dated December 1, 1999, from Allan Sheldon to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing concern over private for-profit health care systems and de-insured services

Sessional Paper 1218/99

Letter dated November 25, 1999, from Barry Crittenden to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing concern over privatization of provincial campgrounds and on pending legislation for private hospitals/clinics

Sessional Paper 1219/99

Article entitled "How to Keep the Public Hospital System Healthy," by Stephen Leeder, published in the Sydney Morning Herald, April 15, 1999

Sessional Paper 1220/99

Letter dated December 2, 1999, from David W. Bond, M.D., President of the Alberta Medical Association, to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, expressing concerns regarding Bill 40, Health Information Act

Sessional Paper 1221/99

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Letter dated November 26, 1999, from Mary Trumpener to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for establishing more parks and wilderness areas in Alberta's Foothills

Sessional Paper 1222/99

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

“Round Tuit” courtesy of the friends of the Head Injury Association
Sessional Paper 1223/99

Letter dated November 9, 1999, from Dr. Steve Chambers, President, Capital Region Medical Staff Association, to Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, regarding the attached survey of physicians conducted by the Capital Region Medical Staff Association

Sessional Paper 1224/99

8 letters dated April 30, 1999, from Albertans to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1225/99

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

Letter dated November 26, 1999, from Jill Konkin, M.D., CCFP, Alberta Chapter of the College of Family Physicians of Canada, to Ms Graham, Hon. Member for Calgary-Lougheed, expressing concern over Bill 40, Health Information Act

Sessional Paper 1226/99

Letter dated April 30, 1999, from Michele Mitchell to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1227/99

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Letter dated October 27, 1999, from Dr. and Mrs. H. J. de Jongh to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing concern regarding Bill 15, Natural Heritage Act

Sessional Paper 1228/99

Letter dated November 25, 1999, from Slawomir Pietrzkiwicz to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to private health care

Sessional Paper 1229/99

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Letter dated April 30, 1999, from an Albertan to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1230/99

Letter dated July 2, 1999, from Christine Chesterman to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for the midwifery profession to integrate itself into the health system permanently

Sessional Paper 1231/99

Article entitled "Transforming Public Services: Contracting for Social and Health Services in the US," written by Steven Rathgeb Smith, Assistant Professor of Public Policy and Political Science, Sanford Institute of Public Policy, published in Public Administration, volume 74, Spring 1996 issue

Sessional Paper 1232/99

Article entitled "Analyzing the Contracting-Out of Government Services: Relevant Cost-Benefit Considerations," written by Stanley C. Wisniewski, Assistant Professor of Business Economics at the Kogod College of Business Administration, published in Public Budgeting and Finance, Summer 1991 issue

Sessional Paper 1233/99

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

Fact sheet entitled "Debating Time for Bill 40, Health Information Act"

Sessional Paper 1234/99

Dutch Protection of Personal Data Act, dated November 1999

Sessional Paper 1235/99

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

8 letters dated April 30, 1999, from Albertans to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1236/99

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

6 letters dated April 30, 1999, from Albertans to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1237/99

7 letters dated November 17, 1999, and October 22, 1999, from Albertans to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for the protection of the Chinchaga Foothills region

Sessional Paper 1238/99

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry:

Letter dated October 6, 1999, from Allan P. Jobson to Hon. Mr. Dunford, Minister of Human Resources and Employment, with attached documentation (evidence package 1) regarding a WCB (Workers' Compensation Board) claim

Sessional Paper 1239/99

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert:

3 letters dated April 30, 1999, from Albertans to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1240/99

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods:

Fax dated November 25, 1999, from Garth and Cathy Peevey to Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, expressing support for the drug Ribovone to be put on the subsidized list of Alberta Blue Cross

Sessional Paper 1241/99

Letter dated November 18, 1999, from Wendy Sauvé to Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, expressing opposition regarding for-profit health care

Sessional Paper 1242/99

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

8 letters dated April 30, 1999, from Albertans to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1243/99

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

8 letters dated April 30, 1999, from Albertans to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1244/99

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood:

CBC commentary by Muriel Stanley Venne in Edmonton regarding the criminal case of Jack Ramsey, Member of Parliament

Sessional Paper 1245/99

Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East:

Annex 2: Domestic Support: The Basis for Exemption from the Reduction Commitments

Sessional Paper 1246/99

Hon. Mr. Kowalski, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly:

Memorandum dated December 1, 1999, from Mr. Johnson, Hon. Member for Wetaskiwin-Camrose, to Hon. Mr. Kowalski, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, requesting that Bill 208, Prevention of Youth Tobacco Use Act, 1999, come up for Third Reading on Tuesday, December 7, 1999

Sessional Paper 1247/99

Memorandum dated December 1, 1999, from Mrs. Laing, Hon. Member for Calgary-Bow, to Hon. Mr. Kowalski, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, requesting that Bill 210, Charitable Donation of Food Act, come up for Third Reading on Tuesday, December 7, 1999

Sessional Paper 1248/99

Ministerial Statements

Hon. Mr. Zwozdesky, Associate Minister of Health and Wellness and Minister Responsible for the Premier's Council on the Status of Persons with Disabilities, made a statement regarding International Day of the Disabled Person, December 3, 1999, and the many abilities, contributions and accomplishments of disabled Albertans.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, commented on the statement.

Oral Question Period

During Oral Question Period, Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, tabled the following:

Letter dated March 17, 1998, from Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, to Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, regarding public consultations on the proposed health information protection legislation with attached Alberta Liberal Caucus news release dated December 2, 1999, entitled "Klein's Heavy Hand Silences Debate on Health Privacy"

Sessional Paper 1249/99

During Oral Question Period, Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, tabled the following:

Letter dated November 30, 1999, from Paul Greenwood, Cardiologist and Clinical Professor of Medicine, to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, expressing support for Bill 40, Health Information Act

Sessional Paper 1250/99

Members' Statements

Mr. Stevens, Hon. Member for Calgary-Glenmore, made a statement regarding the community menorah lighting ceremonies to be held December 5, 1999, in Calgary and in Edmonton on the grounds of the Legislature in honour of Hannukah, the Jewish holiday.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, read Revelations 13:16 and 17 in the context of closure of debate on Bill 40, Health Information Act, and the exchange of personal health information through the electronic network Alberta Wellnet.

Ms Kryczka, Hon. Member for Calgary-West, made a statement regarding the Symposium on Aging, Planning for the Future, held November 18-20, 1999, at the Ramada Edmonton Inn to promote public policy regarding seniors' issues.

Projected Government Business

Pursuant to Standing Order 7(5), Mr. Sapers, Acting Official Opposition House Leader, asked a question pertaining to the order of Government Business to be brought before the Assembly for the following week.

Hon. Mr. Zwozdesky, Deputy Government House Leader, gave notice of projected Government Business for the week of December 6 to December 9, 1999:

Monday, December 6	Aft.	- Introduction of Bills Bill 46 Government Bills and Orders Second Reading Bills 43, 44 Third Reading Bill 7 Committee of the Whole Bills 43, 44, 38, 40 And as per Order Paper
	Eve.	- Government Bills and Orders Third Reading Bill 7 Committee of the Whole Bills 38, 40 And as per Order Paper
Tuesday, December 7	(4:30)	- Government Bills and Orders Second Reading Bill 46 Third Reading Bill 7 Committee of the Whole Bill 38 And as per Order Paper

	Eve.	- Government Bills and Orders Committee of the Whole Bills 46, 45, 43, 44, 38 And as per Order Paper
Wednesday, December 8	Eve.	- Government Bills and Orders Third Reading Bills 46, 45, 43, 44, 38, 7, 40 And as per Order Paper
Thursday, December 9	Aft.	- Government Bills and Orders Third Reading Bills 43, 44, 38, 7, 40 And as per Order Paper based on progress Monday, Tuesday and Wednesday

Motions Under Standing Order 40

Ms Barrett, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands, requested the unanimous consent of the Assembly for consideration of the following motion:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to facilitate a fair settlement in the labour dispute at the Bethany Care Centre in Cochrane where the use of unqualified replacement staff is threatening patient safety.

Unanimous consent to proceed was not granted.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 45 Appropriation (Supplementary Supply) Act, 1999 (No. 2) — Hon. Mr. Day

A debate followed.

Mr. Clegg moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to. The question being put, with Mrs. Gordon in the Chair, the motion was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 40

Boutilier	Fritz	O'Neill
Broda	Graham	Paszkowski
Burgener	Hierath	Pham
Calahasen	Johnson	Renner
Cao	Kryczka	Severtson
Clegg	Laing	Smith
Coutts	Langevin	Stelmach
Day	Lougheed	Stevens
Doerksen	Magnus	Strang
Dunford	Mar	Thurber
Evans	McFarland	Woloshyn
Fischer	Melchin	Yankowsky
Forsyth	Nelson	Zwozdesky
Friedel		

Against the motion: 11

Carlson	Massey	Sloan
Dickson	Nicol	Soetaert
Leibovici	Pannu	White
MacDonald	Sapers	

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 43 Fiscal Responsibility Amendment Act, 1999 — Hon. Mr. Day

A debate followed.

Mr. Magnus moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 45 Appropriation (Supplementary Supply) Act, 1999 (No. 2) — Hon. Mr. Day

A debate followed.

Pursuant to Standing Order 61(3), at 5:15 p.m. the Speaker/Deputy Speaker immediately put the question on the Appropriation Bill standing on the Order Paper for Second reading, which was agreed to.

The following Bill was read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 45 Appropriation (Supplementary Supply) Act, 1999 (No. 2) — Hon. Mr. Day

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Zwozdesky, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 5:17 p.m. until Monday, December 6, 1999, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski,
Speaker

Title: Thursday, December 2, 1999